

# A Meta-Analytic Review on The Relationship Between The Variables Regarding Group Participation and Turnover Intention

İsmail Özdemir<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Sport Science Faculty, Sport Management Department, İstanbul Gedik University, İstanbul, TR

E-mail: ismail.ozdemir@gedik.edu.tr

**Abstract:** This study aimed to survey the effect of the variables regarding the group participation such as ethnicity, discrimination and organizational diversity on turnover intention. This study used a meta-analytical perspective. 26 studies were used for the meta-analysis. Comprehensive Meta-Analysis Software (CMA) is used. Heterogeneity analysis and publication bias test are applied. The results showed that ethnic diversity has a small effect on turnover intention and diversity climate has a medium effect on turnover intention. Three relationships were listed in the review part of this study. The results of this study can be used by future researchers who will study similar variables surveyed in this study. Moreover, the managers who determine organizational policies for ethnically diverse organizations can use the information provided by this study.

**Keywords:** *Ethnicity, diversity climate, organizational diversity, discrimination, turnover intention.*

## 1. Introduction

The group participation of the behaviors determine the performance of an organization and it is a good indicator of their motivation. They indirectly affect various variables such as knowledge sharing that are vital for an organization. Group identification can be shown as a good example of a variable affecting the group participation. It is the tendency of an employee to define himself together with a group and accepting their failures and problems as their own. Such employees also feel pride with the success of such groups.

Ethnicity is a negative attitude regarding group participation and it may affect the relationships in an enterprise. The employee can be ostracized due to his/her ethnicity. This situation can increase the turnover intention of the employee. But the reason for such an increase on turnover intention can be the perception of the employee or the attitudes of the employees.

Discrimination is another negative attitude. Even though it is a crime, such attitudes exist, but in a socially acceptable level. Therefore ethnicity is neglected. But the people may react to a person from a different ethnicity by legally accepted behaviors. Ostracism can be shown as an example. Ethnicity can start various mistreatments. Thus, the importance of ethnicity cannot be underestimated.

Mistreatment is not the only effect of ethnicity. Employees can easily avoid mistreatment by hiding their ethnicity. Providing privilege or support can be another effect of ethnicity. The owner of the enterprise may tend to protect and support certain employees due to their ethnicity. Such a discrimination is also difficult to prove.

The main objective of this study is to investigate the effect of the variables affecting the group participation of the employees on the turnover intention. A meta-analytic review is used to survey these relationships.

## **2. Conceptual Relationships**

The study of Buttner et al (2012) determined the effect of ethnic diversity on turnover intention. The direction of this relationships was positive. Self et al. (2020) confirmed this effect. But this study determined a negative relationship.

Jolly et al. (2020) emphasized the effect of diversity climate and showed that it has a negative effect on turnover intention. The organizations with high ethnic diversity can decrease turnover intention. Levin (2003) focused on the perceptions of the employees and suggested that diversity perceptions affected turnover intention negatively.

Hosoda (2016) suggested that accent can also be a reason for discrimination. He made a research on 256 expatriates living in the United States and found that perceived accent discrimination has a significant effect on turnover intention. There was a positive relationship between these two variables. Thus, the hypothesis of this study is prepared as below:

H1: Ethnic diversity/diversity perceptions/discrimination has a significant effect on turnover intention.

In an organization, there are various processes and various work-groups. The performance of these work-groups determine the performance of such processes. Consequently work-groups are important and the performance of the employees in such groups has a strict connections with the work-group identification. The hypothesis shown below can be derived according to the information given here:

H2: Work-group identification has a significant effect on turnover intention.

## **3. Methodology**

This study used a meta-analysis technique and PRISMA (Moher et al., 2009). These generally accepted guidelines are followed. GoogleScholar, Web of Science, Scopus, and Proquest databases are searched to reach the eligible studies. 20 eligible studies were used for this meta-analysis.

The author searched the databases on december, 2020. He screened a total of 2,745 abstracts. The keywords used for this research were “turnover intention”, “ethnicity”, “diversity”, and “discrimination”. The studies providing correlation values regarding such relationships were chosen.

The collected studies were analyzed by using Comprehensive Meta Analysis Software (CMA). Heterogeneity analysis and publication bias tests were carried out. The data sets including less than 4 studies were not suitable for publication test and they were excluded.

The studies were coded according to their distinctive characteristics. The author also coded the studies to determine possible moderating variables. The quality of each study was tested by using Zangaro and Soeken (2007). None of the collected studies were coded as medium or low quality, all of them were scored as high.

## 4. Findings

### 4.1. Meta-Analysis Findings

The first step of meta-analysis was heterogeneity analysis. This analysis showed that all the data sets are heterogeneous. The results are in table 1. The data set regarding the relationship between ethnicity and turnover intention included 14 studies, the data set regarding the relationship between diversity climate and turnover intention included 3 studies, and the data set regarding the relationship between perceived organizational diversity and turnover intention included 2 studies.

**Table 1.** Results of Heterogeneity Analysis.

Surveyed Relationship	I <sup>2</sup>	P value	k	r
Ethnicity-turnover intention	90.147	0	14	.089*
Diversity climate-turnover intention	83.174	0	3	-.41*
Perceived organizational diversity-turnover intention	88.782	0	2	.02
Work-group identification	83.214	0	2	-.33*

\*: significance at .01 level

The effect size of these relationships are also indicated in table 1. The effect size of ethnicity on turnover intention is .089 and the effect size of the diversity climate on turnover intention is -.41. The effect size of the relationship between perceived organizational diversity and turnover intention is nonsignificant.

The publication bias is known as a tendency of publishing some certain results and rejecting the others that are in a range. In fact, it is a kind of consistency determined by publication bias tests. This inconsistency can be corrected by artifact correction.

The publication bias tests were applied to the first set and they are not applied to the other data sets as the number of studies was not high enough to provide significant results. The publication bias tests of the first data set regarding the relationship between ethnic diversity (ethnicity) and turnover intention did not indicate any sign of publication bias. The observed and adjusted values were equal to each other in Duval and Tweedie's trim and fill test, therefore it was not necessary to trim any studies. The Egger's regression test results did not exceed the threshold that was .033 (Egger et al., 1997).

### 4.2. Review Findings

Some of the surveyed relationships were investigated by just one study, therefore they are not added into meta-analysis. Hence, they are listed in the review part of this study. These relationships and the studies confirming these relationships are shown in table 2.

**Table 2.** The Other Relationships

Antecedent	Sample size	Correlation	Confirming study	Sector	Country
Racial dissimilarity	197	.23	Richard et al.,2019	various	USA
Perceived accent discrimination	256	.17	Hosoda,2016	various	USA-expat
Perceived discrimination	310	.723	Qablan & Farmanesh, 2019	hospitality	North Cyprus

<b>Antecedent</b>	<b>Sample size</b>	<b>Correlation</b>	<b>Confirming study</b>	<b>Sector</b>	<b>Country</b>
Change oriented organizational citizenship behavior	480	-.267	Campbell,& Im,2016	public	South Korea
Involuntary citizenship behavior	152	.358	Chae&Hahm, 2018	various	South Korea

Racial dissimilarity refers to low ethnic diversity, it can also be accepted as a reverse scale of ethnic diversity scale. Perceived accent discrimination is the discrimination occurring due to the accent of an employee. Perceived discrimination is the overall discrimination perceived by the employee.

**5. Discussion**

Work-group participation can be accepted as a dimension of organizational identification as this construct uses work-groups instead of the whole organization. Our study showed that work-group participation is a significant antecedent of turnover intention and it has a negative effect on turnover intention.

Discrimination is a concern for the organizations as it can trigger mistreatment (Qablan & Farmanesh, 2019). It is also a significant antecedent of turnover intention. The variables related to ethnicity and discrimination are important for the ethnically diverse organizations.

The results of this study suggested that ethnicity (ethnic diversity) has a significant effect size on turnover intention. The direction of this relationship is positive. This results indicated that increasing ethnic diversity increases turnover intention. 13 of the 14 studies was conducted in the United States and 1 study was conducted in South Africa. 5 of these studies found a negative relationship between these two variables, 1 of them found the correlation value as zero and the others found a positive relationship between these variables.

The effect of perceived organizational diversity on turnover intention was nonsignificant. Hsiao et al. (2020) found the direction of this relationship as positive and Levin (2003) found the direction of this relationship as negative. These contradicting results affected the significance of the finding.

The review part of this study listed 3 antecedents of turnover intention. Perceived discrimination has a high correlation value between turnover intention and this value is close to .8 which is close to the threshold of multicollinearity (Cohen, 1988). Qablan and Farmanesh (2019) provided the correlation value for this relationship, but they did not test the multicollinearity.

**6. Limitations and Future Study**

Some relationships were not added into meta-analysis and it was not possible to test the publication bias of some studies taking place in the meta-analysis. But the number of studies surveying these relationships can increase in time and future meta-analysis studies may provide more valid and reliable results.

**7. Conclusion and Implications**

The effect size of the relationship between ethnicity (ethnic diversity) and turnover intention is *small* (Cohen, 1988). The effect size of the relationship between ethnic diversity and turnover

intention is *medium*. The effect size of perceived organizational diversity on turnover intention is not significant.

This study was the first meta-analysis study surveying the effects of aforementioned variables on turnover intention. Previous meta-analysis studies investigating the antecedents of turnover intention did not list these variables (Park & Min, 2020; Tett & Meyer, 1993; Choi & Kim, 2016; Kim and Kao, 2014).

The findings of this study can be used to determine human resources management policies or the organizational policies of the managers aiming to decrease turnover intention. Especially, the managers of ethnically diverse organizations can use the results of this meta-analysis. They will be useful to determine the factors affecting turnover intention.

The findings of this study can be used by the future researchers. This study will guide the researchers. Moreover, future researchers can use the studies used in the review part of this study for their meta-analysis.

## References

- [1] Acker, G.M. 2010 The influence of managed care on job-related attitudes of social workers. *Social Work in Mental Health*, 8(2) pp 174-189
- [2] Azanza, G., Moriano, J.A., Molero, F., & Mangin, J.L. 2015 The effects of authentic leadership on turnover intention. *Leadership & Organization Development Journal* 36(8) pp 955-971
- [3] Cohen, J. 1988 *Statistical power analysis for the behavioral sciences* (2nd ed.) Hillsdale NJ: Lawrence Earlbaum Associates
- [4] Banerjee-Batist, R., & Reio, T.G. 2016 Attachment and mentoring relations with junior faculty's organizational commitment and intent to turnover. *Journal of Management Development* 35(3) pp 360-381
- [5] Buttner, E.H., & Lowe, K.B. 2017 Addressing internal stakeholders' concerns: The interactive effect of perceived pay equity and diversity climate on turnover intentions. *Journal of Business Ethics* 143 pp 621-633
- [6] Buttner, E.H., Lowe, K.B., & Billings-Harris, L. 2012 An empirical test of diversity climate dimensionality and relative effects on employee of color outcomes. *Journal of Business Ethics* 110 pp 247-258
- [7] Campbell, J.W., & Im, T. 2016 PSM and turnover intention in public organizations: Does change-oriented organizational citizenship behavior play a role? *Review of Public Personnel Administration* 36(4) pp 323-346
- [8] Chae, H., & Hahm, S. 2018 Differential effect of organizational citizenship behavior and involuntary citizenship behavior on turnover intention and emotional exhaustion. *International Journal of Business Research* 8(2) pp 126-134
- [9] Chen, Y., Park, J., & Park, A. 2012 Existence, relatedness, or growth? Examining turnover intention of public child welfare caseworkers from a human needs approach. *Children and Youth Services Review* 34 pp 2088-2093
- [10] Coetzee, M., & Oosthuizen, R.M. 2017 Work-role psychosocial flourishing: Its mediation role on workplace bullying and employee turnover intention. *Journal of Psychology in South Africa* 27(3) pp 211-215
- [11] Cunningham, G. B. & Sagas, M. 2004 Examining the main and interactive effects of deep and surface level diversity on job satisfaction and organizational turnover intentions. *Organizational Analysis* 12(3) pp 319-341
- [12] Egger, M., Davey-Smith, G., Schneider, M., & Minder, C. 1997 Bias in meta-analysis detected by a simple, graphical test. *British Medical Journal* 315 pp 629-634
- [13] Ferdik, F.V., & Hills, P. 2018 Analyzing further predictors of correctional officer professional

- orientations: The role of turnover intentions. *International Journal of Offender Therapy and Comparative Criminology* 62(6) 1668–1693
- [14] Harris, J.J., Harris, R.B., & Brouer, R.L. 2009 LMX and subordinate political skill: Direct and interactive effects on turnover intentions and job satisfaction. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology* 39 10 pp 2373–2395
- [15] Hosoda, M. 2016 Perceived underemployment, perceived accent discrimination, and job attitudes among immigrants: The mediating role of perceived organizational support. *Journal of Organizational Psychology*, 16(2), 11-28.
- [16] Hsiao, A., Ma, E., Lloyd, K., & Reid, S. 2020 Organizational ethnic diversity's influence on hotel employees' satisfaction, commitment, and turnover intention: Gender's moderating role. *Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Research* 44(1) pp 76–108
- [17] Jin, M.H., McDonald, B., & Park, J. 2018 Person–organization fit and turnover intention: Exploring the mediating role of employee followership and job satisfaction through conservation of resources theory. *Review of Public Personnel Administration* 38(2) pp 167–192
- [18] Jolly, P.M., & Self, T.T. 2020 Psychological diversity climate, organizational embeddedness, and turnover intentions: A conservation of resources perspective. *Cornell Hospitality Quarterly*, 16 pages. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1938965519899935>
- [19] Kim, H. & Kao, D. 2014 A meta-analysis of turnover intention predictors among U.S. child welfare workers. *Children and Youth Services Review* 47(3) pp 214-223
- [20] Lee, A.A., & Jang, Y. 2016 What makes home health workers think about leaving their job? The role of physical injury and organizational support. *Home Health Care Services Quarterly* 35(1) pp 1-10
- [21] Levin, A.G. 2003 Profession at risk: Why are so many workers leaving the field of child welfare? Exploring the relationship between diversity, inclusion, supervisory support, stress, job satisfaction and intention to leave among public child welfare workers. Doctoral dissertation. University of Southern California USA
- [22] Lindsay, S., Sheehan, C., & De Cieri, H. 2020 The influence of workgroup identification on turnover intention and knowledge sharing: the perspective of employees in subsidiaries, *The International Journal of Human Resource Management* 31(3) pp 432-455
- [23] Lu, L., Lu, A.C.C., Gursoy, D., & Neale, N.R. 2016 Work engagement, job satisfaction, and turnover intentions: A comparison between supervisors and line-level employees. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management* 28(4) pp 737-761
- [24] Mynatt, P.G., Omundson, J.S., Schroeder, R.G., & Stevens, M.B. 1997 The impact of Anglo and Hispanic ethnicity, gender, position, personality, and job satisfaction on turnover intentions: A path analytic investigation. *Critical Perspectives on Accounting* 8 pp 657-683
- [25] Park, J. & Min, H. 2020 Turnover intention in the hospitality industry: A meta-analysis. *International Journal of Hospitality Management* 90 11 pages. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2020.102599>
- [26] Qablan, N. & Farmanesh, P. 2019 Do organizational commitment and perceived discrimination matter? Effect of SR-HRM characteristics on employee's turnover intentions. *Management Science Letters* 9(7) pp 1105-1118
- [27] Richard, O.C., McKay, P.F., Garg, S., & Pustovit, S. 2019 The impact of supervisor–subordinate racial-ethnic and gender dissimilarity on mentoring quality and turnover intentions: do positive affectivity and communal culture matter? *The International Journal of Human Resource Management* 30(22) pp 3138-3165
- [28] Self, T.T., Gordon, S., & Ghosh, A. 2020 Increasing management retention: The mediating role

- of organizational embeddedness on coworker support and turnover intention. *International Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Administration*, <https://doi.org/10.1080/15256480.2019.1708224>
- [29] Tepper, B.J., Carr, J.C., Breaux, D.M., Geider, S., Hu, C., & Hua, W. 2009 Abusive supervision, intentions to quit, and employees' workplace deviance: A power/dependence analysis. *Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes* 109 pp 156-167
- [30] Tett, R.P. & Meyer, J.P. 1993 Job satisfaction, organizational commitment, turnover intention, and turnover: path analyses based on meta-analytic findings. *Personnel Psychology* 46 pp 259–293
- [31] Zangaro, G. A., & Soeken, K. L. 2007 A meta-analysis of studies of nurses' job satisfaction. *Research in Nursing & Health* 30(4) pp 445–58